Who Governs the Microbe?
Governance of Infectious Disease
South Africa`

Qiong Qiu
Irfan Kherani
Shivani Sud
Advisor: Evan Lieberman
The Questions

- How and why do elected and non-elected leaders respond to and prioritize policy problems in different ways?
- Why do different types of authorities respond to different problems?
- How and why does this vary across time and space?
The Team

- Irfan Kherani (Princeton, Undergraduate)
- Erin Lin (Princeton, Graduate)
- Gwyneth McClendon (Princeton, Graduate)
- Estelle Prinsloo (Rhodes, Graduate)
- Qiong Qiu (Princeton, Undergraduate)
- Shivani Sud (Princeton, Undergraduate)
- Gcobani Qambela (Rhodes, Undergraduate)
- Siyabonga-ka-Phindile Yonzi (Rhodes, Graduate)
Outline

- Closed ended survey in 8-12 municipalities with a goal of 200 responses.
- Semi-structured interviews with councilors and various types of authorities in 1 metropolitan area and 3 local councils
- Passive observations, of what you see, local meetings of councils/committees, other relevant information
- Newspaper/archival research: Spend time in the library looking through newspapers and finding reports that highlight the politics of the governance of infectious disease
The Surveys

- Set up time and place to administer the survey at 10 municipalities.

- Sample questions:
  
  Who in the society should be responsible for the challenges of HIV, TB, crime, housing, etc?
  
  Who has access to local councilors?
  
  What is the councilors' position on controversial issues?
Interview

✧ We aim to choose a sample that is representative of the council regarding political party, race, and constituency.

✧ Sample questions:
  ✧ What are the major public health projects?
  ✧ What is the relationship among the different levels of government?
  ✧ What are the main sources of conflict and competition around AIDS policy?
Challenges

✦ Delegation – officials at different municipalities have different responsibilities.

✦ Delays – general council meetings were often postponed or cancelled.

✦ Politics – frequent major changes in top local government officials
  - Sundays River Valley – office close due to planned protest
  - Port Elizabeth – councilors refuse surveys and interviews.
Impressions

- Results from the surveys are waiting to be analyzed during the coming year.
- Local councils follow requirements superficially.
- Ambitious AIDS policy is difficult to enforce with existing fragile health care system.
Housing, unemployment, and sanitation are the current focus.

Unclear relationship among different level of government.

http://www.fordfound.org/newsroom/events/229
Governmental Organizations

- **Purpose**: To gain understanding of what role governmental organizations play in the creation and implementation of infectious disease policy.

- **Relevant sources of information**:
  - Provincial and municipal health representatives – policy
  - HIV-AIDS based forums – discussion
  - Provincial and municipal clinics – implementation
  - Passive observations – overall

- **General Observations**
  - Lack of and misuse of funding
  - Lack of clear division of responsibility
Bureaucratic Officials

Relevant interviews:

- Provincial Authority
  - District Manager
  - Sub-District Managers
- Municipal Authority
  - Municipal Manager
  - Executive Director of Community Services
  - Director of Primary Health
  - ATTIC (AIDS Training, Treatment & Information Center)

Observations:

- Lack of clear division of responsibility – parallel systems
- Inconsistency between national plan and local implementation
Bureaucratic Health Meetings

 Meetings Investigated:
- AIDS Council Meetings – Local/Provincial/National
- Intersectoral Health Forum – Port Elizabeth

 Observations:
- Ineffective leadership – Mayor & ATTIC
- Preoccupation with structure of meeting
- Unknown purpose – reporting versus discussion
- Strong NGO participation and presence
Provincial and Municipal Clinics

- **Interviewed:**
  - Nurse/Sisters
  - Clinic Managers
  - Clinics Supervisors

- **Observations:**
  - Lack of funding for medication and human resources
  - Inconsistencies between provincial and municipal clinics
  - Strong preventative and ground level treatment
Hospital Levels

- Hospitals:
  - Community Health Center – Metro
  - Primary Hospitals – District – General
  - Secondary Hospitals – Regional – Specialist
  - Tertiary Hospitals – Educational – Super-Specialist
  - Private Hospitals

- Observations:
  - Unreliable primary health care negatively affects hospitals
  - Provincially mandated and run
Passive Observations

Observation Sources:
- Municipal Council Meeting – Makana
- General Interview Observations

Observations:
- Low priority of infectious disease issues relative to others
- Party issues
  - Voting practices
  - Changing government
- Preoccupation with structure of meeting
Non-Government Authorities

- International Donors, Churches, Business, NGOs, Traditional Authorities

- Key Issues

  - Many felt that their need arose due to a lack of government response to the crisis
  - Is HIV/AIDS the symptom or the disease?
The Questions

- Background
- Projects
- Policy Making/Governance
  - What role do local NGO’s play on the problems of disease control and how do they cooperate or conflict with local government?
- Politics
  - During the recent election campaign for the April 22 election, did political parties talk about concerns of health and disease? Which parties?
- Perceptions
  - When someone dies of a particular illness, do families ever prefer that this illness not be discussed?
Churches

- Vast fluctuation in the degree and tone of response
- Issues with promiscuity and stigma prevented some churches from addressing HIV/AIDS
- Some churches discuss safe sexual practices, and help with home based care
- Most churches bring awareness to the disease through candle lighting ceremonies
International Donors

❖ Conflicts over which strategy is best
❖ Many international donors are results driven
  ✤ US AID cutting out their prevention program, because it is easier to track ARV distribution
❖ Donors vary in degree of involvement
  ✤ Foreign government donors like PEPFAR are usually the most demanding
Businesses

- View combating TB and HIV/AIDS as a matter of maintaining their workforce and human capital
- Most businesses have very strict confidentiality policies
- Try to set up a support network but stigma complicates these efforts
- Recent cases of MDR and XTR-TB leading to more cautionary policies

http://www.germanyandafrica.diplo.de/Vertretung/pretoria__dz/en/__PR/2009__PR/03/03__VW__Polo__order.html
Non-Government Organizations

- Address several infectious disease related issues
  - Home based care, ARV distribution, Child care programs, Gardening programs, etc.
  - Many NGOs have clinics that diagnose, and administer ARVs
    - Many people prefer to go to NGOs clinics instead of the government clinics because they are closer and the service is better
- NGOs tend to fill the gaps in government health service delivery
- Most NGOs view themselves as permanent entities, not temporary organizations
- Discontent with the disconnect between the quality of policy and implementation
Traditional Authorities

- In rural areas traditional leaders are prominent

- Government traditional healer training programs
  - Circumcision ritual
  - Coordinate traditional remedies with ARV therapy

Focus on Education

- HIV/AIDS is included in the curriculum for primary school students
- Many schools are poorly equipped
- Teachers are uncomfortable with the subject material
- NGOs attempt to use more young and dynamic personalities to engage with children
- Tracking success of education programs is difficult